



**STATE ASSESSORS BOARD
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 19, 2008
State Treasurers' Board Room, Richard H. Austin Building
430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan**

CALL TO ORDER: The September 19, 2008 meeting of the State Assessors Board was called to order at 9:32 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room in the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan.

ROLL CALL: Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Raman A. Patel, Vice Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Member (arrived at 9:40 a.m.)
Maxine J. McClelland, Member
Frederick W. Morgan, Member

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the regular meeting minutes of the August 18, 2008 meeting of the State Assessors Board with correction of the minutes to strike the language in the initial roll call regarding Morgan's departure.

PUBLIC COMMENT: There was no public comment.

FINANCIAL REPORTS: It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to receive and file State Assessors Board financial reports for the months of April 2008 through July 2008.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

1. A communication from the Executive Secretary regarding mandatory renewal program quiz failures was reviewed by the Board.
2. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to grant approval to the level 3 experience qualification requests of Mr. Jeffery S. Hammerberg, Mr. Matthew T. Heering, and Ms. Frances O. Patton.

CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS: It was moved by Morgan, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to grant formal approval to the list of certification applicants provided to the Board. The list of certification applicants which was approved by the Board and the certification totals presented to the Board were as follows:

**Certification Applicants
September 8, 2008**

Level 1

Bell, April G.
Carr, Sr., Calvin L.
Clark, Joseph L.

Ericson, Charles
Karakos, Susan C.

Schneemilch, Mark J.
Schultz, Sharon A.

Level 2

Griling, Tamara
Rothley, Robin L.

Stafford, Jane M.
Stirton, Claudia G.

Trayling, Anita M.

Level 3

Allen, James S.
Busscher, Brian

Huffman, Rhonda S.
Small, Brian D.

Zakalowski, Laura

**Certification Totals
September 8, 2008**

Level 1	564
Level 2	929
Level 3	890
Level 4	<u>147</u>
Total	2,530

FIRST CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, Michigan Compiled Law (MCL) 15.268(h). (See also the Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.243(1)(b)(ii), 15.243(1)(d), and 15.243(1)(k) and the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.267(2).) A motion was made by Patel and seconded by McClelland to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following items:

1. Discussion of the closed meeting minutes from August 18, 2008
2. Discussion of a narrative appraisal grader reinstatement request
3. Discussion of narrative appraisal 204
4. Discussion of recent course examination results
5. Formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0018

A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Patel to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

OPEN MEETING ACTION ON FIRST CLOSED MEETING ITEM: It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adjourn the formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0018 until the November 13, 2008 meeting of the Board.

SECOND CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.268(a) and 15.268(h). (See also the Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.243(1)(b)(ii).) A motion was made by McClelland and seconded by Patel to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following items:

1. Informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0027
2. Discussion of revocation petition 06-0028
3. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0025

A motion was made by McClelland and seconded by Patel to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

OPEN MEETING ACTIONS ON FIRST AND SECOND CLOSED MEETING ITEMS:

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the closed meeting minutes of August 18, 2008 as presented.
2. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to interview the individual requesting to be reinstated as an anonymous narrative appraisal grader.
3. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve the grader's failing grade for the first submission of narrative appraisal 204.
4. It was moved by Allen, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to adjourn the informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0027 until the October 17, 2008 meeting of the Board.
5. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 06-0028. It was moved by Allen, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to note the importance of accurate appraisal record cards in the dismissal notification letter to the assessing officer.
6. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to hold an informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0025.

OTHER BUSINESS:

1. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to adopt the 2009 State Assessors Board meeting schedule with the January meeting of the Board to be held on January 7, 2009 and with the Executive Secretary to update the meeting schedule with the site

of the Michigan Association of Equalization Directors annual conference when the location of that conference is finalized.

2. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve as presented the certificate of appreciation for Matthew J. Raftary for his work on the on-line quiz for the current mandatory renewal program.

3. It was moved by Allen, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to adopt the criminal conduct policy/procedure as presented for assessing officers who have been convicted of or pled no contest or guilty to a criminal offense in performing assessment administration duties prescribed by rule or law.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: The next meeting of the State Assessors Board is scheduled for October 17, 2008 at 9:30 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room of the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, in Lansing.

ADJOURNMENT: It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 11:00 a.m.

Date minutes typed: September 28, 2008

Date minutes approved: 10-17-08



Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson